



**Common Council
Meeting
City of Middletown
October 15, 2019**

1. Pledge of Allegiance- Pres. Rodrigues asked all to rise for the pledge.
2. Roll Call: Present: Ald. Ramkissoon, Tobin, Kleiner, Johnson, Jean-Francois, Burr, Green, Masi, Rodrigues-9
3. Approval of Minutes

On motion of Ald. Masi seconded by Ald. Burr to accept the minutes from August 20, 2019 as submitted.

All in favor

4. Correspondence
John Naumchik-Nothing this evening.
5. For the Good
No one came forward.
6. Reports of Dept. Heads

Maria Bruni/Community Development-This evening on the agenda is a resolution to authorize my dept. to lead agency for the preparation of the 2020-2024 Consolidated Plan; authorizing the Mayor to sign all certifications. We are beginning our 5 yr. HUD plan for the office and I forward to your support.

Police Chief Ewanciw-Nothing this evening.

John Naumchik/City Clerk- Reminder about early voting that starts Saturday, Oct. 26th and it will be at the Senior Center. It is going to be from 10/26-11/3 and there are different times and all on our website. Any questions please call our office at 346-4166.

7. Public Hearings & Grievances
John Naumchik-Nothing this evening.
8. Petitions & Complaints
John Naumchik-Nothing this evening.
9. Remarks of the Mayor

Mayor DeStefano-First I would like to congratulate Chief Ewanciw and the Middletown Police Dept. on the article recently in the Times Herald Record. As you know the Chief has implemented many positive programs within the PD. Remarks were appropriate in the paper very positive, something we continue to monitor. We always look at crime over a period of time not a short period of time, trending over years. Trend is very good and very positive. We are happy that the police patrols in the neighborhood received very positive feedback from our residents and it appears to be working as the Chief said it would. I want to thank the Chief and men and women of the Middletown Police Dept. for a job well done.

This morning at the Paramount Theatre the City hosted the White Cane event. Basically it is October 15th is a day of awareness for visually impaired blind folks. There are many state agencies, local agencies have people who use the services that are offered by all these agencies. It was a pretty interesting program Sen. Skoufis and Metzger were both there, I spoke myself. There were demonstrations that were done for people blindfolding them or closing their eyes to show how difficult it is to navigate. One of the reasons why Middletown was chosen this was arranged through The Center for Independent Living, Doug Huvey who is in a wheelchair himself for many years I believe. Was the focus on what we are doing here citywide, not only downtown. You are all aware of the project that we have going on with sidewalks and not only sidewalks but intersections specifically; that almost every traffic light within city those intersections will now become ADA compliant. Sidewalks will be replaced about 200-250 ft. from each intersection, there will be ramps, pedestrian crossings I think most of them if not all of them and the new sidewalks we are putting down Dolson Ave. throughout the downtown will be all new sidewalks, high pedestrian areas will be getting new sidewalks and there will be some re-configuration. Today is an annual event, October 15th which happens to be my mother's 90th birthday. Happy birthday mom if you are watching. The idea behind it is to raise this awareness and I think my message when I spoke was about within that room you are basically speaking to the choir. They are taking the people who are either providers of service or advocates for those services. When they speak to people like me and I speak to you and I tell you about it and bring that awareness that is really where it hits home. Because this is not a one level of government answer it

is multi levels, we have a local level, we need funding from the state and federal agencies which we are doing. There is an economic side to it also. Businesses making your high pedestrian area business friendly for people with disabilities. Not just those that are visually impaired but all types of disabilities.

We talked about some of the mistakes that were made in the past in Middletown; for example, when you come out the Paramount Theatre you go in handicap accessible it is street level. You cross South St. and you run into a 6 inch curb and you have to roll up if you are in a wheelchair you have to use your wheelchair to go up to the driveway opening in order to get to the parking lot. We had the same situation on North St. over by Something Sweet. When you came across King St. you went into a curb. We ended up doing that on a temporary basis we replaced and made a handicap accessible crossing just a little bit up the street. So these are investments that we are making in our community, we have done so in our pools. Raelynn is the person who coordinates with our Rec. programs, our Davidge Park pool is ADA compliant, has a lift, our lifeguards are trained on how to use it. We do a disability swim once a week, we have programs that are geared to folks with cognitive and physical disabilities. We are looking to do more in those areas. Today was a very educational opportunity for all of us that did attend and hopefully Center for Independent Living will put it up on video so that you will have an opportunity to watch some of the speakers from both the state of NY and local agencies as they address the issue. One interesting speaker was I don't remember her name but she is purchasing a home on 13 Ridge St., as you know is part of our CDA program. Excellent group of people to listen to and they had a young lady who is attending college talking about the difficulties about maneuvering through a community. How to react to a person with a disability, someone with a guide dog please don't pet the dog, don't ask to pet the dog. Don't ask them for help, do you need help? It would be a good watch for you to hear her perspective and perspective of the other people. If we are able to get it we will put it on Channel 20 and I think people should take a few minutes to watch certain parts of it.

Heritage Trail we had a press conference as you know with the County, the Record didn't give us much coverage so we are very disappointed, Rachel. But we did get coverage on Mid-Hudson News, probably the most talked about thing around the City is the Heritage Trail and what is the status of it. We did have the ribbon cutting, culvert has been signed, bid has been awarded, and equipment is at the site. We are anticipating that trail hopefully done sometime in mid-2020. We do have a meeting coming up in the next week or two with the County to start the final planning for Phase 3, the East Main through West Main out to Ingrassia Rd. section of the trail. We are going to be meeting with Mr. Brooks and his staff to complete that final design.

Reservoir Trails we are hoping to have them open sometime late October early November. Mr. Bianchi from the Parks Dept. has been working with some volunteer groups to get the trail signage up, the color coded signage that is necessary to open

Phase 1. We hope to have people out there as I said late this month or early November.

One thing I am asking the Council to do and it will be done at the next Board of Estimate meeting and hopefully forwarded to the Council. Most of the reservoir system is in the Howells Fire District so they will be the responding emergency services agency. I met with Howells about a month or two ago and they are purchasing a new piece of equipment for \$43,000 it is a utility terrain vehicle for emergency response. It is something we will need out there, of course they are not saying that we have to give them money in order for them to buy it. They requested that the city make a contribution to the Howells Fire District so they can more than adequately cover the area. So their ask is \$10,000, I reviewed it with Council President who actually has some fire service background and he was in agreement with it. Mr. Masi also at the Board of Estimate we will be forwarding to you in a formal way at the next Board of Estimate meeting and requesting a \$10,000 transfer.

Don Paris, Moody's has really given us some more positive comments on our fiscal status. I will read you the one line- trends for the city have been positive with increasing fund balances due to pro-active management and conservative budgeting.

As you know we are going through the budget process now, I don't know how conservative we are going to be this year but I think we are going to be on target to be under the tax cap again. At or under the tax cap. So that will be another positive. We are hoping for an upgrade next year from Moody's and this is a positive trend towards that upgrade.

Firehouse security. As you know we did an RFP. We had several inquiries. I think 3 or 4 people did tour the facilities and we did have one response to the RFP. Board of Estimate did meet last week and we decided to award the contract NY Security which is a local company. Been in business for an awful long time in the Middletown area. They do a lot of business and hotels, a lot of government work. They do some of the County work, communities like Town of Montgomery. All 3 firehouses will have the cameras installed, total about 39 or 40 cameras. We decided to go with the 3 yr. lease with a 3 yr. option to extend. The reason behind that will be all inclusive. So there will be no maintenance, no equipment replacement. Whatever happens is on the company and any upgrades will be included during those periods. The cost is \$26,000 down payment and \$2,500 a month for a 3 yr. period. I believe there is a resolution tonight John, to award that, once it is awarded we will be meeting with NY Security to designate areas that we feel where the cameras should be installed at. Obviously we are not going to install them in sleeping quarter areas of the Fire Dept. We are going to try maintain as much privacy as we can and the non-public areas of the firehouse. Entrances, card swipes will be on the doors; we will know who is going in and out. The Fire Dept. will establish protocols on how they are going to handle people going in and out. We cannot have a repeat ever of what happened last year or before and this is the first step. I ask for your support tonight.

Ald. Johnson- When you talk about walk a mile in my shoes. Recently about 2 weeks ago I was on 2 crutches and I had to call ahead because I wasn't exactly sure exactly how to get into the building and I had to think about it. I came early to look at the few steps up and make sure I wasn't going to fall. I had to go to a conference in New Jersey on Sunday and I called ahead to make sure that if I was on 2 crutches was I able to get into the building. It is something you don't think about until you don't have it. Is the place you are going to accommodate your needs? That is progress for sure.

Ald. Burr- On the security system Mayor who is going to monitor that?

Mayor DeStefano-We are going to be establishing the protocols. There is a lot of issues with state laws. Obviously retention of records.

Ald. Burr-You can't watch it live, you have to.

Mayor DeStefano-Correct. The live part I'm not sure about. The biggest part will be erasing information, we want to make sure data is saved. God forbid something goes wrong at the Firehouse and all of a sudden you have an 18 min. gap. The idea is to secure the data and secure all the information and develop rules and regulations on how it can be used. For example, most places it can only be used in official capacity. Not with most that is what all should do. You are not going to see information from those cameras on Facebook. Say someone falls asleep and all of a sudden that information appears on Facebook. That is not going to happen and if it does happen we will be able to tell who accessed that information. It is a pretty high tech. system. NY Security is one of the best in the business, as I said they do a lot of work for a lot of big companies. They were the only bidder but we did have several inquiries but they met the criteria that we were looking for. We worked with OC on this to develop the specs. It is not something we did locally, they did the specs. for us through Mr. Burpoe. The Purchasing Dept.

Ald. Jean-Francois-Are the cameras going to be inside the fire dept.? Or outside?

Mayor DeStefano-Both I hope. We want to cover doors, cover the floor of the firehouse, cover door into the control room at the main firehouse. You have to swipe cards on the outside door to allow for access in. The other two firehouses don't have control rooms so we will be controlling the floor of the firehouse where the truck is and exterior doors.

Ald. Jean-Francois-We are not going to have cameras in the kitchen where..

Mayor DeStefano-No. Not in the kitchen, not where their sleeping quarters are. No. The hallways going to... for example, there is going to be the stairway from the 1st floor to the 2nd floor will be covered. We want to know who is going into those rooms. That was one of the problems we had.

Ald. Burr- Some of them leave their doors open.

Mayor DeStefano-Correct. Make sure we have certain protocols on the floor. You want to make sure people still sign in too. That will be something for the Chiefs to handle.

Ald. Burr- They are supposed to do that now.

Ald. Kleiner-Most of the questions from our constituents meeting will wait until the Commissioner is here. I think they relate more directly to him.

The one that we have been asked a couple of times is and you were talking about it tonight, the sidewalks and the project. Do we have any idea when that program will begin, might begin?

Mayor DeStefano-Yes. There are 3 different engineering firms involved in developing the plan. Because there are 3 different sources of money. The first source is what we call the Schumer money that was federal money re-appropriated.

\$2.7million. Those plans are approved by DOT and ready to go.

2nd is WSP which is a large, large engineering company. They are preparing the Dolson Ave., all the intersections, all traffic light intersections. That should be ready to go to bid from what I was told today sometime in November. This work is not going to begin this year, spring of 2020.

3rd company is Lehman & Getz they are doing the parking lots under the DRI and some of that money is also going to sidewalks. The issue is the coordination between the 3 different companies and the fact that we need to coordinate for a couple of reasons. One take Franklin Square for example you are going to have 200- 250 ft. going down to W. Main St. of new sidewalks, James St. you are going to have 200-250 ft. going up and then in the middle is going to be the third funding source. We don't want to do corner and corner and leave the middle with old sidewalks. So its 3 different sources, 3 different engineering firms; once the final plans are in they will then coordinate. They also will require coordination of implementing, we don't want to shut down the whole James St. parking lot at once. Half of James St. will be done first and then the other half will be done. The rear of City Hall that will be done at separate time, Orchard St. that lot will be done. Hopefully first because businesses will be opening very quickly. So it's a coordination issue between the 3 companies. WSP just to give you an idea how big they are, they were the firm that was recently selected to do the Rte. 17M site for the state. It is a huge study for the traffic, it is a big firm all of it should be ready. Lehman & Getz should have theirs by the end of October, so everything should be ready to go to bid by November.

10. Remarks of the Aldermen

Ald. Masi-I would like to say no comment tonight but I think that would shock an awful lot of people and obviously disgust me.

I really don't know where to start but I will start with this.

Jerry you just absolutely disappoint me. I know that goes on deaf ears.

Ald. Kleiner- Not appropriate.

Ald. Kleiner- Cannot make out

Also someone said it is Roberts Rules

Ald. Masi- It started at 7:22 am on Sunday morning when my phone went off. I looked at it and I had several texts. One of from someone I won't mention, I will tell you this that person is not in this room tonight.

The message read "Kleiner the snake strikes again". I had no idea what they were talking about, I said what are you talking about? They said obviously you haven't read the paper and I said no on Sunday I have been an usher at St. Joseph Church for the last 15-20 yrs. and I do the 11:30 mass. I get up late on Sunday's I then read the paper. I went on my front porch, got the paper and read it. I got to Ald. Kleiner's article. I shook my head, thought about it and I said well I am going to compliment him on something. The word timing you are going to hear several times tonight in my talk because Ald. Kleiner was very smart in the timing of that article. He knew that on Sunday in My View we are on vacation on Monday there was no chance for a rebuttal. Unless you are at this meeting tonight and I was hoping that it was a packed house, I'm hoping that a lot of people are watching or at least you people who are watching who are here can tell other people to watch. Because there is a rebuttal.

Ald. Kleiner is a very intelligent young man for what he did. Because unless you watch this the only information you have is what he put out there. I will give him credit on this most of the information in there is correct. However, you need someone to dot the I's cross the t's and put it all in perspective. That is what I am going to do right now.

I think it was back in 2004-2009 I believe Ald. Kleiner was on the Common Council. He sat in one of these seats and the salary was \$5,000. I think probably in 2010 right around that time he took the opportunity to run against our Council Pres. and he lost and he was off the council for a while. Salary still \$5,000 per aldermen. In 2013 he decided to run again, he was successful. Won in November not going to take office until January 1st. Salary \$5,000 here's the timing. On December 17th of 2013 the Council decided to increase the salaries and increased it by 100% from \$5,000 to \$10,000. Jerry happened to be at that meeting. He wasn't on the Council and he did speak he didn't think it was right, he's pretty much always said that. He stayed on track. Like I said he spoke at that meeting.

On January 1st he was at that meeting and when it came time for comments, actually it was January 7th 2014 now salary was raised from \$5,000 to \$10,000. Jerry was

upset with that, didn't like the way it was done. Just like he doesn't like the way it is being done now. I got the minutes of the January 7th 2014 and Ald. Kleiner- nice to be back, he talks about some other things. Nothing about the raise. It didn't bother him so much because he took that \$5,000 for 2014, 2015, 2016, 2017, 2018, and 2019. That \$30,000 didn't bother, now 2 yrs. ago we discussed amongst ourselves the Council of raising the Mayor's salary, Council Pres. and aldermen salary. After some discussion it was decided we wouldn't raise the aldermen salary but we would raise the Mayor and Council Pres. and that passed.

Right after that several aldermen said you know what you were right, a lot of people think we raised the aldermen salary and we should revisit that the next time around. For the last year and half it has come up once in while amongst this group.

Now January of this year if Ald. Kleiner was so intent that you shouldn't do this until petitions are signed or the other timing I will get to it in a minute I really got a kick out of that part of it. All he had to do January, February somewhere along there say if we are going to decide on raising the aldermen salary for 2020 I want to do it now and I am making a motion. Nothing was said. He was also smart enough to understand that in order to do it for a ballot for the people and I think voters should decide at ballot box on aldermen's salary. That is the headline his article on Sunday. He also puts in that article that he knew that in order to do that you have to do that 60 days prior to the election, never said word one. Not word one.

Now a couple of weeks ago the reporter puts an article in and he is dead set against it. I said to him, I said Ald. Kleiner we have 9 votes on this council we are all individuals. We all have our own ideas, I do not fault you for being against this if that is what you feel and if you feel that is right that is fine and dandy. Some others feel differently. I said if you grandstand on this I am going to come after you for that \$5,000. It bothers you so much that you actually used the terminology "unethical" I understand you have said that that you didn't say that. Kleiner said he thought the proposal was terribly unethical I think they the Common Council should be embarrassed to even vote on it.

So if you think it is so bad and by some chance it passes and I don't know we are going to have a vote here sometime before the night is up. If it passes you can do what one other person did years ago a good friend of mine he couldn't take the money so there is precedent for this all you have to do is contact Don Paris our Treasurer and say I'm aggrieved so much that they did this I'm not going to take that \$5,000. Now I also know because you mentioned it to me, I know you mentioned it to other people that is exactly what you are going to do and I think you said that because I put you on the spot here at a meeting and I told you exactly what I was going to do if you grandstand. I told you if you decided you weren't in favor of this and you just voted no and you didn't make accusations that I would not say word one. I told you that on Thursday, talked to you for 45 mins. and I then I wake up on Sunday morning.

Now let me address some of the stuff that you actually put in that article. You were upset obviously because the last few times aldermen salary were raised it was after an election and I purposely said to the Council if we are going to do this we are going to do it before the election and I know what your comment is going to be. Well it was after anyone has an opportunity to run for us; but you knew that in January, you knew that in February, never said word one.

The School Board. Apples and oranges are you kidding me? There's a past president of the School Board. Anyone on the school board knows that there is no salary. Anyone that decides to run for Council knows there is a salary. Told right out there. Then you actually told what I believe is a lie on the first article when you mentioned that we are losing positions in the Rec. Dept., losing people and not replacing them. How about hiring some more skilled people? I think you spoke to the Mayor about that and I think he straightened you out.

Then you brought up the CSEA, they only gotten so many raises, what was left out there was they were offered something else. Where at the time they had 105 members, every one of them would have gotten a \$1,000 up front and would have gotten \$9,000 plus their raises would have been almost double what they did. However, they were not given the opportunity to vote on that because the officers and leaders of the CSEA refused to allow them to vote. You left that out. And I think you knew what you were doing and in fact I bet anything on knew what you were doing.

The insurance that is something that always been. Now its grown granted and there is a buyout. You also left out the fact that there is somebody on this Council who doesn't get the insurance nor the buyout; it's not you by the way. So when I read that article I said wow the hypocrisy of it.

You had no problem taking \$30,000 and if I had to make a wager now that when I am finished and it comes to your turn you are going to say I'm not going to take the \$5,000 I told people I wasn't. That is because you were put on the spot. I sat right here in this room... right here in this room every aldermen here will testify to it. I said Jerry if you do that I'm coming after you. There is no reason for it. I have no problems with you not supporting it, I understand you never liked the idea. But when you throw around terms like unethical and I know that upset people and I noticed that some people had said that to you that you conveniently left that terminology out of your My View column.

I can't tell you how aggravated I was when I saw that. We are in line with, one of our other aldermen sent out the salaries of other communities in OC and I noticed you put in the Town of Wallkill they get \$14,500 or whatever it is. But there is only 4 of them. That is rhetorical that is not my problem that there is only 4 of them. You think we do less work because 8 of us than what Wallkill does with 4. I don't.

Probably want to stop here before I say some stuff that I may at some point be sorry for. You know Jerry we had a nice conversation on Thursday, nice time on Saturday at the Historical Society, but, you are just a phony. How could you possibly not say to me on Thursday night or on Saturday by the way Joe I wrote in My View column and let me speak to you gentleman to gentleman and I implored you? I said look Jerry, if you don't say anything I'm not going to bring your name when it comes time I am just going to say no comment and when the vote comes, whatever the vote is if it should pass; I implored you to just take the money. Everyone could use it. You are probably one of the hardest working aldermen. You go to a lot of stuff. But for you to play that card and make us look foolish that we should be embarrassed for taking a vote. I'm sorry you are wrong in my eyes.

Ald. Tobin- I made my decision. I do think Jerry is one of the hardest working aldermen. I do see how it struck a nerve the language.

Ald. Green- I would like to start I did promise Capt. Luis from the Phoenix Engine Co. that they are doing a firefighters spooky maze at the North St. Firehouse the last 2 weekends of October and Halloween Night from 6pm-9pm. I know that many of the members have been putting in a lot of hard work on this. I saw some pictures on it and I know they would be happy if the public stopped by.

I was able on Saturday to stop by the Hillside Cemetery. I did do that walking tour briefly. Really you need a whole day to walkthrough there, everything is absolutely amazing. If you do get a chance to go over certainly there is a nice little guide that would help you to look around there.

I do want to say Happy Birthday to the Mayor's mom quite the milestone. Hopefully she's partied hard enough that she is not sitting home watching this. Definitely a staple in our community as well.

The Local Law- I too made a decision. I want to thank everyone who has spoken to me who has met with me whether be fellow aldermen, union members, non-union members, constituents, people who are not even in the community thank you all. Your comments, concerns have all been heard. I think I made the right decision when it comes to my vote and we will go from there.

Thank you.

Ald. Johnson-I thought the Local Law conversation would take place at the end of the evening.

I am going to follow my colleague Mr. Green's suite and talk about lighter issues.

... go to page 3 you can't get any better than page 3 unless you are on are on page 1. You did a good job. Congratulations to all.

I did read with interest that the NAU staff may be cut in half. But I was reassured... thought the program would still be functional and beneficial to us all. I appreciate that.

Kudos to you and the crew.

Middies the last home game I think is the 25th, if I'm on less than one crutch I will be selling cheeseburgers. Support the team. It is great for our community.

There was an article in Monday's paper about the deer. A couple of years ago, Ald. Kleiner and I went to the workshop in Westchester. We had a town meeting, we talked about how the deer in Middletown I think at that time you were told we had 5-8 times more deer than we could support. We talked about ways to mediate that. Most of them were not thinking such community found tasteful. Because ... so it kind of went by the wayside.

This article reminds us that OC is the top county in the state for 10 yrs. for automobile accidents. I have a survey in my office from 2015 that said I think one insurance company throughout the state 2015 there were 80,000 car accidents related to deer. Totaling to \$265 million in repairs, they also indicated that crop damage totaled \$59 million in repairs. In 2015 the calculations was \$323 million in damages through deer. There is probably more deer now than there were then. That is the way that goes. Of course in today's paper there was no article about early voting on how beneficial it could be. It is an experiment and of course we would like the experiment to be successful to continue.

Now local law. Yes it was a fact I was on the school board for a long time and certainly one of the montours of public officials are you agree to disagree.

The subsidiary remark is attack the idea not the person. Ok.

Is that a bumper sticker? Is that a philosophy of this organization? I'm not really sure. There's also element of free speech in this conversation. Certainly hallmark of our democracy it is a clear...transparency and transparency is a good thing.

So this story started when Mr. Masi introduced the idea. I think he had standing to do so he is a senior member of the Council. He is the chairman of the Finance Committee and one of three people on the Board of Estimate so I think he has standing to bring it to the floor.

Then on Sept. 13th as alluded to in the article in the Record that said the aldermen ...consideration that the law was terrible and unethical and I think they should be embarrassed to vote on it. I am certainly someone who takes offense to those remarks. I don't feel that is attacking the idea, I feel that is attacking the person. May be attacking is a strong word, maybe not. May be I am just a sensitive guy Jerry, I don't know. But just saying that I should be embarrassed because I don't agree with

you I find disparaging, inappropriate and tremendously presumptuous that you would have those words to say.

Now but only agree to disagree.

Unethical that strikes a chord in me. In have spent half of my adult life in public office if you take 17 on the board and 6 here you can do the rest of the math. Also many people know and many did not know I was named to the OC Ethics Committee on Sept. 1st of 2011. What do we do on that committee? Well. We have 2 charges one is to review all the disclosure forms of all the employees and all elected officials. That is about 340 documents, each require 3 signatures to go to our committee. So our committee reviews equivalent 1,000 documents a year, we are looking for inter-relationships between people and what they want to do, what job they want to have, who they are related to that is a contractor within the County and when we have doubts we ask them to come in and we question how is it going to go. What exactly does this mean when you say you do this... Does that make me an expert on ethics? Far from it. It was pretty much a low profile job for a while till somebody who is now named as Legislature A several years ago took a job with a company and clearly appeared to be in violation of ethics because he was now soliciting through the Legislature business was pumping. That resulted in the Grand Jury consideration where no criminal charges were found and that situation was transferred to the Ethics Committee and we had a formal hearing. I was on that panel and we judged he acted in an unethical manner and he needed to remove himself from that source of employment and he was fined \$1,000 in punitive damages because of that law.

As a result of that the County upped the ante on ethics. They put a program in place, there's a training program and everybody has to go on the webinar like we do for sexual harassment and make sure you read and listen to it all and answer the questions.

So every month I sit for an hour or two with 3 lawyers. One is a former lawyer for the OC Legislature, one is a retired judge for OC and one is our private attorney from a firm in NY. So I do get to listen to the nuances of ethics on a regular basis.

If we have to get a reading on that somebody should submit a question, the other thing we do on the committee is do RFO. Request For Opinions. They are confidential. Somebody writes a document they say this is what I am thinking about, it is ethical or would it be judged unethical by this committee.

Some of the questions that we receive is not in our jurisdiction and we have to go back to the municipality like some of them are. It would be interesting to see the question was submitted what the answer would be. I do not know what the answer would be. Once again I would agree to disagree.

The next install in this conversation was what I would call the official for the people. I did ask Jerry for his copy, we did speak privately before that. There are two things I don't care for in this meeting some need clarification in my mind. I strongly object to the illegal meeting held on Sept. 3rd and there is also ...going on here. Killer words. Then of course this document morphed into In My View. I actually smiled on Sunday because when I served on the School Board which was intermediately dysfunctional over the years back in that day My View was the ultimate power. Timing was everything when we put it in place. That is old school, I am not sure if it is effective now as it was in 1987. But touché on that. Agree to disagree.

With respect to the idea that there was an illegal meeting I was not at that meeting so I can't speak to it. But coincidentally also served as President of the Board of Directors for Cornell Cooperative Extension and I was up in Albany for our annual conference at the Statler Hotel at Cornell University. The board ... there were 54 of us from each county in the state. 2 people, Board of Directors and Executive Director. My job coincidentally was hour and half workshop on Open Meetings Law and FOIL. The representative there was from COOG, Committee on Open Government and we had a very in depth conversation about meetings. If you read public officers law Section 7 Item 100.3 it clearly states the fact that if committee is in a place as a quorum they are forbidden from discussing committee business. And that could be a social function, political function, ribbon cutting, that could be at the diner having a cup of coffee but it is clear that if you are 5 or more on a 9 member board you should not be discussing committee business. The spirit of the law is clear, the public has a right to know if you were discussing committee business, when you discussing it and if I choose to be present I have the right to so to listen to the comments. So that case I agree to agree.

Having said all that I have found the last 5-6 yrs. to be a very a collegial and cooperative environment. I would like in our team to a crew team honest analogy. Yeah we are a shell we are a 8 people we each have a nuance, we each pull with equal strength, wisdom and fortitude and if we don't we can't go in the right direction. Who is the coxswains? That is a word you can google. The coxswain is the president of the board, the mayor and the administration and I think we did have done a pretty good job because if we were off course we wouldn't be where we are today. I think we have made progress with lightning speed and we have been kept in the right direction. In our right lane and moving forward. And a crew is a group of people with a common effort trying to achieve a common goal. And I think we deserve kudos for that.

Having said all of I will have two things to say. #1 you will never find me disparaging any of you with respect to your character or judgement when it comes to a vote at this table. That won't happen.

#2 I respect, admire and appreciate Mr. Kleiner. I think he is a very good contributor, reputable attribute to this community and to our community. And you can take that one to the bank as well.

I have been talking for a while not as long as Masi, that's a first. So some people might say why when is he going to stop flapping his lips for God's sakes. When is he going to get over himself? Simple answer. I just did.

Ald. Ramkissoo- We have been through this a couple of times since my time on the board. My personal reaction from my constituents when it had come to times to increase salaries things like that. Have always been when I turned to my constituents, meetings or e-mail that they do not see an issue and that to me is a stamp of them being pleased with the work that Ald. Johnson and I do for them. That they see the investment, time that we put in for them.

Again, the elections serve to remind you the kind of job you are doing. If you are worthy of salary earned here, because anyone can run if you live here in this community at any time and step up and decide how much time it will take away from their main job because this is not a full time job, our families, our children. ... I recommend they do, we had many years uncontested election and frankly I would like to say we are doing a great job and people understand. Ald. Green just went through a primary, his wife is about to have a baby where is he? Out knocking on doors talking to people, sacrificing that time with his family. It is a big commitment. Are we worthy of the salary? Are we worthy of the same salary as people on the board in Wallkill? I believe that we are. We have made sure that we have taken care of our contracts, employees, rank and file and I think timing wise it is not inappropriate. Also every member of this board is entitled to their vote and the reason behind that vote. Ethically speaking any attempt to influence another board members vote whether it be intimidation or coersion or shaming. I think that is a question of ethics and I don't think anyone here should feel that they have to be shamed with changing their vote by words that have been printed. I myself do not see an issue with the Local Law and I encourage people to get involved in local politics.

I think this ward has worked very well together to get it done.

Ald. Kleiner-Congratulations to the Middies on the Erie Bell. It is back, it was here but they take it over to Port for the game. Congratulations on keeping it in Middletown. You have quite a streak going.

Weather will be getting cold soon. Warming Station opens November 17th. Little bit more than a month away and they have to be ready for it so they are going to do training for the Warming Station. If anyone is interested in possibly volunteering. The dates for the Warming Station training is this Thursday the 17th all 7 pm at St. Pauls Church on the Mulberry St. entrance. Next Tuesday the 22nd of October and Wednesday the 30th.

Thank you Andrew for the website. You can always go to MiddletownWarmingStation.com and sign up and volunteer.

I only had one thing to say at the Ribbon cutting for the Heritage Trail that was hallelujah. It is finally here, almost it is on its way. So just knowing that bids are out, construction started that is a promise that finally has been met.

Along time entrepreneur in the obit but anyone who knows the State Hospital in the old days knows "Ottie's Attic". Ottie's Attic was in a couple of places and ended up in the Kleiner building that was nice. She (Ottie Brewer) ran a thrift store but it was mostly for the patients benefit, she passed away this week at 99 ½. I just want to take note of that and there was no service so I just want to pay my respect.

I know Roberts Rules personal attacks are not allowed in remarks and should never be addressed. If you want to address ideas that is one thing. I don't decide what the headline would be, I don't decide when it hits the paper that is not my decision. I will speak to the law specifically when we should, when we vote on the Local Law.

Ald. Jean-Francois- Chief, congratulations. This is well deserved should of happened a long time ago. Not only are you and your dept. are committed to protect the City of Middletown, serve the City of Middletown but you also and your dept. had a chance to feed our community. Pop-up bar-b-ques was popping up everywhere this summer and the Police dept. walking the neighborhood. Well deserved.

Ald. Burr- My fellow aldermen said it all. We all have the right to vote.

11. Unfinished Business

John Naumchik-Nothing this evening.

12. New Business

218.19 Resolution to authorize the Treasurer to transfer a total of \$38,000.00 within the Police dept. 2019 budget to cover the cost of necessary camera repairs and upgrades to replace and repair those that are in need of service

On motion of Ald. Tobin seconded by Ald. Green

RESOLVED; that the Common Council of the City of Middletown hereby concurs with the Board of Estimate and Apportionment to authorize the Treasurer to transfer a total of \$38,000.00 within the Police Department 2019 budget to cover the cost of necessary camera repairs and upgrades to replace and repair those that are in need of service and/or upgrade in the following manner:

From	Amount	To
A.3120.110 Part-time officers	\$28,000.00	A.3120.200 Equipment
A.3120.433 Training	\$10,000.00	A.3120.200 Equipment

Roll Call: Ayes: Ald. Ramkissoon, Tobin, Kleiner, Johnson, Jean-Francois, Burr, Green, Masi, Pres. Rodrigues-9

219.19 Resolution to accept a donation in the amount of \$196.20 from United Way for the Middletown Cares Coalition.

On motion of Ald. Burr seconded by Ald. Jean-Francois

WHEREAS; The Middletown Cares Coalition received a donation in the amount of \$196.20 from United Way.

WHEREAS; The Middletown Cares Coalition is requesting that the Common Council accept this donation and authorize the Treasurer to deposit the donation into the T.0094 trust account; and,

NOW, THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED, that the Common Council of the City of Middletown, NY, does hereby authorize the Treasurer to accept the donation and deposit it into the existing trust account for the amount of \$196.20 for the Middletown Cares Coalition.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ald. Ramkissoon, Tobin, Kleiner, Johnson, Jean-Francois, Burr, Green, Masi, Pres. Rodrigues-9

220.19 Resolution to authorize the Mayor to sign a Memorandum of Understanding (MOU), expiring on March 31, 2020, with KaBoom to fund, build and improve playgrounds in our community.

On motion of Ald. Burr seconded by Ald. Tobin

WHEREAS; KaBoom is a national non-profit organization dedicated to bringing active play to youth and families in under-resourced communities in America. They will partner with us to fund, build and improve playgrounds in our community, and

WHEREAS; as the Recreation & Parks Department continues to enhance and improve its park system, we are requesting that the Mayor be authorized to sign a Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) with KaBoom.

SO LET IT BE RESOLVED; that Common Council concurs with the Board of Estimate and Apportionment to authorize the Mayor to sign the attached Memorandum of Understanding (MOU), expiring on March 31, 2020, with KaBoom to fund, build and improve playgrounds in our community.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ald. Ramkissoon, Tobin, Kleiner, Johnson, Jean-Francois, Burr, Green, Masi, Pres. Rodrigues-9

221.19 Resolution to transfer \$10,000.00 within the Police Department 2019 budget to cover the costs associated with repairing our vehicles.

On motion of Ald. Tobin seconded by Ald. Green

RESOLVED; that Common Council concurs with the Board of Estimate and Apportionment to authorize the Treasurer to transfer \$10,000.00 within the Police Department 2019 budget to cover the costs associated with repairing our vehicles in the following manner:

From	Amount	To
A.3120.400	\$10,000.00	A.3120.440
Contractual Services		Repairs to Equipment
Injured dog fees		

Roll Call: Ayes: Ald. Ramkissoon, Tobin, Kleiner, Johnson, Jean-Francois, Burr, Green, Masi, Pres. Rodrigues-9

222.19 Resolution to declare a 2006 Ford Crown Victoria and 2010 Dodge Charger surplus for the Police Department.

On motion of Ald. Masi seconded by Ald. Green

RESOLVED; that Common Council concurs with the Board of Estimate and Apportionment to declare the following vehicles from the Police Department surplus and no use to the City and

dispose of the 2006 Ford Crown Victoria and 2010 Dodge Charger through the next auction for surplus vehicles by the direction of the Commissioner of Public Works:

2006 Ford Crown Victoria – VIN #2FAHP71W16X134574
2010 Dodge Charger – VIN #2B3AA4CT5AH287669

Roll Call: Ayes: Ald. Ramkissoon, Tobin, Kleiner, Johnson, Jean-Francois, Burr, Green, Masi, Pres. Rodrigues-9

223.19 Resolution to accept a donation in the amount of \$400.00 from Middletown Lions Club for the Disc Golf Course.

On motion of Ald. Burr seconded by Ald. Johnson

WHEREAS; The Middletown Recreation Department was given a donation in the amount of \$400.00 from Middletown Lions Club.

WHEREAS; The Middletown Recreation & Parks Department is requesting that the Common Council accept this donation and authorize the Treasurer to deposit the donation into the existing trust and agency account T.0043 Recreation Donations; and,

NOW, THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED, that the Common Council of the City of Middletown, NY, does hereby authorize the Treasurer to accept the donation and deposit it into the existing trust and agency account T.0043 for the amount of \$400.00 for the development of the Disc Golf Course.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ald. Ramkissoon, Tobin, Kleiner, Johnson, Jean-Francois, Burr, Green, Masi, Pres. Rodrigues-9

224.19 Resolution to designate Community Development to be lead agency for the preparation of the 2020-2024 Consolidated Plan and authorize the Mayor to sign any required certifications and documents pursuant to the Plan.

On motion of Ald. Green seconded by Ald. Tobin

WHEREAS; the Office of Economic & Community Development will be preparing a 5 year Consolidated Plan pursuant to HUD regulations, and

WHEREAS; the Office of Economic & Community Development is requesting to be designated lead agency for the preparation of the 2020-2024 Consolidated Plan

SO LET IT BE RESOLVED; that Common Council concurs with the Board of Estimate and Apportionment to authorize the Office of Economic & Community Development to be designated lead agency for the preparation of the 2020-2024 Consolidated Plan and authorize the Mayor to sign any required certifications and documents pursuant to the Plan.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ald. Ramkissoon, Tobin, Kleiner, Johnson, Jean-Francois, Burr, Green, Masi, Pres. Rodrigues-9

225.19 Resolution to accept a donation in the amount of \$485.00 from the Middletown Little League for Park Improvements.

On motion of Ald. Burr seconded by Ald. Jean-Francois

WHEREAS; The Middletown Recreation & Parks Department was given a donation in the amount of \$485.00 from the Middletown Little League; and,

WHEREAS; The Middletown Recreation & Parks Department is requesting that the Common Council accept this donation and authorize the Treasurer to deposit the donation into our Park Improvements Account (7110.478); and,

NOW, THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED, that the Common Council of the City of Middletown, NY, does hereby authorize the Treasurer to accept the donation and deposit it into our Park Improvement account for the amount of \$485.00.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ald. Ramkissoon, Tobin, Kleiner, Johnson, Jean-Francois, Burr, Green, Masi, Pres. Rodrigues-9

226.19 Resolution to transfer \$10,000.00 from the General Fund Balance and authorize the Mayor to sign an agreement with Optima Environmental Services to remove a 1,000 gal. underground tank at 393 County Highway 78.

On motion of Ald. Jean-Francois seconded by Ald. Tobin

RESOLVED; that Common Council concurs with the Board of Estimate and Apportionment to authorize the Mayor to sign the attached agreement with Optima Environmental Services and authorize the Treasurer to transfer \$10,000.00 from the General Fund Balance for underground fuel tank removal at the Star Center located at 393 County Highway 78 to clear the way for the state to complete the SEQRA process and for the city to purchase the property in the following manner:

FROM	AMOUNT	TO
General Fund	\$10,000.00	A.1490.400
		Contractual Services

Roll Call: Ayes: Ald. Ramkissoon, Tobin, Kleiner, Johnson, Jean-Francois, Burr, Green, Masi, Pres. Rodrigues-9

227.19 Resolution to authorize the Treasurer to transfer a total of \$29,575.00 from the General Fund Balance for payment to CJBD General contracting for payment of emergency repair to a large section of the North Street Firehouse roof.

On motion of Ald. Tobin seconded by Ald. Green

RESOLVED; that Common Council concurs with the Board of Estimate and Apportionment to authorize the Treasurer to transfer a total of \$29,575.00 from the General Fund Balance for payment to CJBD General contracting for payment of emergency repair to a large section of the North Street Firehouse roof and replacement of the two sections of the North Street Firehouse in the following manner:

FROM	AMOUNT	TO
General Fund (Older Building Roof)	\$14,405	A.1620.470 Repairs to Building
General Fund (Building Addition Roof)	\$15,170	A.1620.470 Repairs to Building

Roll Call: Ayes: Ald. Ramkissoon, Tobin, Kleiner, Johnson, Jean-Francois, Burr, Green, Masi, Pres. Rodrigues-9

228.19 Resolution to award the bid for the Midland Avenue Ext New Curbs & Sidewalks on the easterly/business side on Midland Ave Extension to Boyce Excavation.

On motion of Ald. Masi seconded by Ald. Burr

WHEREAS, bids were opened by the Board of Estimate and Apportionment on Tuesday, September 26, 2019, for the Midland Avenue Ext New Curbs & Sidewalks on the easterly/business side on Midland Ave Extension, and

WHEREAS, the Board of Estimate and Apportionment referred the bids to the Commissioner of Public Works for his review and recommendation to the Common Council of the City of Middletown, and,

WHEREAS, the Commissioner of Public Works recommends to the Common Council that the bid be awarded to Boyce Excavation.

NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED; that the Common Council of the City of Middletown concurs with the Commissioner of Public Works and awards the bid for the Midland Avenue Ext New Curbs & Sidewalks on the easterly/business side on Midland Ave Extension in the total amount of \$160,560.00 plus 10% Contingency (\$176,616) and Engineering Inspection time of \$11,400 plus 10% (\$12,540) totaling \$189,156.00 with Curbs and Sidewalks will be constructed on the easterly/business side on Midland Ave Ext. There is a capital account established for the project H.956.900 that has a balance of \$132,250 and a budget transfer balance is needed for the difference of \$56,906 in the following manner:

From	Amount	To
Gen. Fund Balance	\$56,906	H.956.900 Sidewalks Midland Ave

Roll Call: Ayes: Ald. Ramkissoon, Tobin, Kleiner, Johnson, Jean-Francois, Burr, Green, Masi, Pres. Rodrigues-9

229.19 Resolution to authorize the Chief of Police to donate 33 bicycles to the United Presbyterian Church which will repair bicycles and donate them back to members of our community.

On motion of Ald. Burr seconded by Ald. Kleiner

WHEREAS; the City of Middletown Police Department has collected 33 bicycles from evidence that have been cleared for surplus by the ID Detective and have not been claimed and request the bicycles be donated to the United Presbyterian Church.

SO LET IT BE RESOLVED; that Common Council concurs with the Board of Estimate and Apportionment to authorize the Chief of Police to donate the attached list of 33 bicycles to the United Presbyterian Church, located at 25 Orchard Street which United Presbyterian Church will administer any necessary repairs to these bicycles and donate them back to members of our community.

Ald. Johnson- How long does it take to accumulate the bikes?

Chief Ewanciw- A little over a year, about once a year we have to discard them.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ald. Ramkissoon, Tobin, Kleiner, Johnson, Jean-Francois, Burr, Green, Masi, Pres. Rodrigues-9

230.19 Resolution to authorize the Treasurer to transfer \$386,677.55 from the Sewer Fund Balance to fund the disposal of landfill sludge for the remainder the fiscal year.

On motion of Ald. Masi seconded by Ald. Tobin

WHEREAS; the WWTP Sludge fee has increased from \$88.25/ton to \$133/ton effective May 2019. This drastic price increase along with excessive Bio solids inventory has depleted the sludge disposal budget, and

WHEREAS; DPW is requesting the following transfer to cover our current sludge disposal expenditure and projection of this expense to cover the remainder of the year:

Four weekly outstanding invoices up to 8/30/19 totaling\$106,878.80
17 weeks @ 5.5 loads/week @ 22.5 tons/load @ \$133/ton\$279,798.75

SO LET IT BE RESOLVED; that Common Council concurs with the Board of Estimate and Apportionment to authorize the Treasurer to transfer \$386,677.55 from the Sewer Fund Balance to fund the disposal of landfill sludge for the remainder the fiscal year in the following manner:

FROM	AMOUNT	TO
Sewer Fund Balance	\$386,677.55	G.8130.466 Landfill Sludge

Roll Call: Ayes: Ald. Ramkissoon, Tobin, Kleiner, Johnson, Jean-Francois, Burr, Green, Masi, Pres. Rodrigues-9

231.19 Resolution to approve and authorize the Mayor to sign an Easement Agreement regarding 180 Seward Avenue, between the City and New Campus, Inc. for the City to maintain the historic and aesthetic significance of the stone wall that is the main entrance of the Community Campus on Monhagen Avenue.

On motion of Ald. Green seconded by Ald. Masi

RESOLVED; that Common Council concurs with the Board of Estimate and Apportionment to approve and authorize the Mayor to sign the attached Easement Agreement regarding Section 21, Block 2, Lot 26 – 180 Seward Avenue, between the City and New Campus, Inc. This easement is necessary for the City to maintain the historic and aesthetic significance of the stone wall that is on the subject premises and which same stone wall continues directly across onto City property. This is the main entrance of the Community Campus on Monhagen Avenue.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ald. Ramkissoon, Tobin, Kleiner, Johnson, Jean-Francois, Burr, Green, Masi, Pres. Rodrigues-9

232.19 Resolution to approve and authorize the Mayor to sign an Easement Agreement regarding 39 West Main Street to allow for air conditioning line on the easterly side of the building on the Premises, which line enters the air space of what is known as Festival Square.

On motion of Ald. Masi seconded by Ald. Tobin

RESOLVED; that Common Council concurs with the Board of Estimate and Apportionment to approve and authorize the Mayor to sign the attached Easement Agreement regarding Section 31, Block 10, Lot 20 - 39 West Main Street, between the City and Weiwei Zhang and Yuzhuo Ba. This easement is necessary to allow for air conditioning line on the easterly side of the building on the Premises, which line enters the air space of what is known as Festival Square.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ald. Ramkissoon, Tobin, Kleiner, Johnson, Jean-Francois, Burr, Green, Masi, Pres. Rodrigues-9

233.19 Resolution to award the only bid for Surveillance Cameras for all MFD buildings to New York Security Systems Inc.

On motion of Ald. Masi seconded by Ald. Tobin

WHEREAS, bids were opened by the Board of Estimate and Apportionment on June 13, 2019, for the Surveillance Cameras for the MFD buildings, and

WHEREAS, the Board of Estimate and Apportionment referred the only bid to the Mayor for his review and recommendation to the Common Council of the City of Middletown, and,

WHEREAS, the Mayor recommends to the Common Council that the only bid be awarded to New York Security Systems Inc.

RESOLVED; that Common Council concurs with the Board of Estimate and Apportionment to award the only bid to New York Security Systems Inc. and authorize the Mayor to sign all paperwork for the leasing of the all the cameras for all the MFD locations as per the attached letter dated June 10, 2019.

LET IT BE FURTHER RESOLVED; that Common Council concurs with the Board of Estimate and Apportionment to authorize the Treasurer to fund this project through the General Fund Balance in the following manner:

FROM	AMOUNT	TO
General Fund Balance	\$26,000.00	A.3410.200 Other Equipment

Roll Call: Ayes: Ald. Ramkissoon, Tobin, Kleiner, Johnson, Jean-Francois, Burr, Green, Masi, Pres. Rodrigues-9

13. Local Law #1 of 2019 increasing the salaries of the Alderman.

On motion of Ald. Masi seconded by Ald. Ramkissoon

Local Law #1 of 2019

A LOCAL LAW INCREASING THE SALARIES OF THE ALDERMAN

BE IT ENACTED BY THE COMMON COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF MIDDLETOWN AS FOLLOWS:

Section 1. Purpose of this Enactment.

The purpose of this enactment is to increase the salaries for the elected Aldermen serving on the Common Council. If approved, the increased salary for each Alderman would take effect with the terms of office commencing January 1, 2020.

Section 2. Section 64 of the Charter of the City of Middletown is hereby amended by replacing the fourth and fifth sentences of the second full paragraph thereof to read as follows:

The annual salary of each Alderman shall be fifteen thousand dollars (\$15,000.00). The aforementioned salaries for the Mayor and President of the Common Council shall take effect with the terms of office commencing January 1, 2018. The aforementioned salaries for each Alderman shall take effect with the terms of office commencing January 1, 2020.

Section 3. Effective Date.

This Local Law shall take effect immediately upon filing with the Secretary of State.

Ald. Kleiner- I wrote a letter to the editor which ended up being in My View. I don't determine when it gets printed. It was going to print earlier in the week, I told Mr. Masi many times in discussion that I had written a letter to the paper to explain why I don't agree with any elected official voting to raise their own salary. I said that letter would be in the paper. As far as I knew it is up to them whether they printed it or not. Because I didn't want to get into all of this, I just wanted to make my position clear. I have spoken about it and always have felt that way.

It was not brought up in January or February before we carried petitions. The office we ran for paid \$10,000. I didn't hear any discussion of a raise that is why I didn't bring it up then. I didn't look up until it was brought up what could be done to put it on the ballot as a petition. Let the voters decide if that is what you wanted to do. Raise the salary for aldermen.

The School Board remark simply it says we want to attract good candidates. The School Board has no salary and they attract some dam good candidates.

When you say if you speak out against it this definition is anyone but one of our board members speaking on anything is grandstanding, it is not them speaking. Well grandstanding is different from explaining your position that you feel strongly. I thank Ald. Johnson for serving on Ethic Boards it is not easy, I have attended almost every Ethics Board meeting in Middletown over the last 15 yrs. My ethics training was in my philosophy degree which majored in ethics and my post graduate work which I majored in political science/political philosophy and ethics. Many, many years of trying to understand, looking at the 27th Amendment of the Constitution. The last one, one of the original Bill of Rights it got passed over 200 yrs. later, finally got ratified by enough states to become part of the Constitution. It says Congress shall not raise their own salary except in another election shall pass. By that they don't mean just before the election when no one else can be a candidate. I don't understand it, I brought up the CSEA because it was mentioned here that everyone else has gotten a raise. The Union got a raise, I said ok let's look at what the Union got. We weren't in on the discussions of what the offers were and what might have been. We are looking at the raises the Union got, we can look at the raises we gave to non-union employees in the City to help them match what the Union got. They got a lot of different give backs and stipulations... The reason why our buy packs went down is because the Union agreed to less money on the buy backs for the insurance. If it had been brought up I certainly would have spoken out about it.

My remarks on the Rec. Commission come right out of, I voted every Rec. Commission meeting. They come right out of the minutes of the Rec. Commission on their need for more help. If it was an overstatement, I'm sorry; but certainly and looking going forward when people are out and people are sick and people most skilled people are resigning, the skilled people have to work their way up you just can't hire skilled people. It is a difficult issue and one that I thought should have been asked to be discussed in Rec. Committee meeting. There are a lot of ways to look at the raise, but the proper way to do it is either by the time I heard the word about the raise and looked up about the petitions. I saw and I read NYS law and it says enable petitions etc. has to be filed 60 days before the election. By the time this came up we were out of time.

I haven't heard anyone say we were thinking of raising aldermen salaries this year. Just haven't heard that. If I had heard it; it should have been at a Finance Committee meeting and it should have been discussed publically and it should have been on the Middletown City calendar. It should have been brought up then.

We had an e-mail asking us all to come here and meet at 7:15 to talk about a raise. That is the meeting in which I was threatened; I said this is unnoticed it is the definition of an illegal meeting. Pulling everyone together on an e-mail to discuss an issue of city

business without any public notification. That wasn't a secret meeting, it wasn't behind closed doors but if you don't tell anybody it might as well be and I made that point clear and they just decided to leave me out of the discussion. I said you don't have that option I am not in to discussion. I checked with the person who took Robert Freemans' place. It is not an official opinion but she said "oh my god" and it is a definition of an illegal meeting. So I don't know what else you need and I just not into doing personal attacks. This is an issue that has come up before and I would like to see NYS pass a law saying "no elected official may raise their own salary" except for the next election cycle. You raise the salary for the office and when someone tells you what a great job you've done and you deserve more money bring it up in Finance Committee and talk about it. But when other people can run for that same office and I don't know what to say about the Council if you think we are not attracting good candidates what does that say about us as a board?

It is flabbergasting but of course everybody is going to vote their own way. I just think it is an issue we should never be put in a position of having to vote on our own raises for the current coming term when we can have no opposition we are all running unopposed. That is my statement I thought I said it pretty clearly and I'm not attacking anyone personally I am just saying it is not the right way to do this. Yes I long ago talked with Don Paris and said I absolutely will not accept the raise. But you are telling me if I vote against this you will ...that is a threat and we shouldn't be threatening each other. We should be talking.

Ald. Masi- Symantec's that is what you just got finished telling us and I happen to agree with you. That no council should vote themselves a raise, we are not voting ourselves the raise. We are voting the next Council, it's not my fault or anybody else in this room fault that people don't run against us. We are not voting this does not take effect until after the next Council is sworn in. Now I know that it kind of looks silly because we are the next council. So under your theory that if in 2 yrs. two of us run unopposed or 3 of us run unopposed and rest of them are unopposed the only people that can get a raise are the ones that ran opposed. Because if we in two yrs. vote another raise for 2022 and happen to be running unopposed are we not entitled, are those people not entitled to it. So it happens to be the law Jerry, and if you want to change the law I have no problem with that go ahead and give it your best shot. But for you to say that there were no conversation, I'm a little hard of hearing and I will write off may be you didn't hear it the number of times we spoke. All you had to do in January, February, March is say I'm going to put it on for right now. If you people want to consider raising the salary in 2020 let's do it now. Never said a word. So that thing about you don't determine when they put the letter in, you knew at the time when you wrote it. You have your view, you have your vote; I'm not surprised and we will move forward. Hopefully as I am concerned and I will tell you in an meeting that is being televised and recorded, once this is done, the vote is taken there is no animosity from my point to anyone on this council. They vote the way they want to vote. If it passes fine, if it doesn't pass so be it. At the next

meeting still have in my mind boy I'm really upset at Ald. Kleiner or Ald. Ramkissoon it's done. This vote will be whatever it is and that will be it. I believe when you mention the Record I thought it was when we spoke and you wrote out that whole thing and gave it to that young lady with me present that is what I thought.

We probably should end it I'm going to end my part and the vote will be what the vote will be.

Discussion ensued regarding Roberts Rule

Ald. Kleiner- I just like to make one response that is Roberts Rule.

If I had heard anything. I didn't bring this up in January, February, because the Council did double their salary back in 2014 I wasn't thinking about a raise. I just hadn't heard the discussion. Again, if there were a discussion there should have been a Finance Committee meeting that is when it should have been brought up. It shouldn't be someone talks to somebody and mumbling about a raise. I didn't hear any of that, I don't hang in those circles I have other things to do. How you would do a raise for the next time is in January of 2021 election in Jan. or Feb. you would bring it up and you would vote on it. Then the people who might consider running for this Council 2022 would know that they are running for an office that is paying \$15,000. So that is how you would do it. The other way you would do it is if you wanted next year there will be a lot of people out voting for the presidential election do a referendum. Put it on the ballot and let the voters decide next year. So you are waiting one year. That is what I thought was the way we should do it and that is the way you could do it. You wouldn't have whoever is unopposed would have nothing to do with it. It would be for the office of aldermen and it would be done ahead of the process by which you become a candidate. If you do it after that you are doing it for the person. That is my comment. I don't think it is ethical to vote yourself a raise. That is my opinion, many years of saying that. Just my opinion.

The comparison with Wallkill came because we got a list of salaries that said this is what Middletown and if you divide it by population Middletown paid the highest amount of all those cities. Our salaries are currently the highest if you divide by population of the examples that were sent to us. I said those numbers don't hold true. If you compare just the individual salary you have toof course the insurance is a major part of what they are going to decide. So for attracting good candidates we should be and I would encourage people to run, encourage more people to get involved.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ald. Ramkissoon, Tobin, Johnson, Jean-Francois, Burr, Masi, Pres. Rodrigues-7
No: Ald. Kleiner, Green-2

14. Audit

On motion of Ald. Masi seconded by Ald. Tobin

I move that the accounts be audited the claims be adjusted and the Treasurer be authorized to issue warrants for their payment.

Roll Call: Ayes: Ald. Ramkissoon, Tobin, Kleiner, Johnson, Jean-Francois, Burr, Green, Masi, Pres. Rodrigues-9

15. Adjournment

There being no further business meeting adjourned at 9:22PM

Respectfully submitted,

Karen Sisco